REOPENING SCHOOLS FOR LEARNING

September 2020: As part of its response to combat COVID-19, the Nigerian government temporarily closed schools. To reopen schools, effective guidelines must be developed and implemented to protect students, staff, parents, and communities against the spread of the virus. In addition, it is imperative to mitigate the effect of COVID-19 closures on learning, and reopening presents a critical opportunity to recover these losses and build a strong foundation for the future of Nigeria’s education system. This policy brief contains: i) guidelines for reopening schools safely, and ii) recommendations for reopening schools to recover learning losses in Nigeria.

INTRODUCTION: THE CURRENT SITUATION IN NIGERIA

Over the past six months, the coronavirus-induced school closures have limited access to learning for students worldwide, resulting in learning losses that could last a lifetime. In Nigeria, where learning levels were already low, the school closures threaten to completely derail the efforts toward achieving sustainable development goal four (inclusive and equitable quality education for all). With the gradual decline in the incidence of COVID-19 in Nigeria, the government has started implementing a phased reopening of the economy, including reopening schools. In August, many students in transitional grades (Primary 6, JSS3, and SS3) resumed classes to complete their specific grades and transitional exams.

On September 3, the government announced its approval of a phased reopening of schools for all grades, and schools across the country are beginning to grapple with how to reopen safely. As of September 21, many states, including Lagos, the epicenter of the pandemic, will begin another phase of reopening. In light of the threat of a second wave of the virus and the acute learning losses resulting from the school closures, two factors are key: first, reopening schools in adherence to adequate health and safety guidelines, and second, recovering learning losses and improving upon the pre-pandemic learning levels that plagued Nigeria’s educational system.

The Centre for the Study of Economies of Africa (CSEA) is a non-profit think tank based in Abuja, Nigeria, that conducts independent, high quality and evidence-based research on economic and development issues in Africa. CSEA’s objective is to use its research findings to facilitate evidence-based policymaking by engaging stakeholders in government, the private sector, development partners, civil society organisations, academia, and the media.

IDinsight is a global advisory, data analytics, and research organization that helps development leaders generate and use evidence to make effective decisions and maximize the impact of their policies and programs. We tailor a wide range of data and evidence tools, including randomized evaluations (RCTs) and qualitative research, to help decision-makers explore the questions they want answered, within the timeline and budget they have available. We work with governments, multilaterals, foundations, and innovative non-profit organizations in Africa and Asia.

Please direct questions about this brief to erika.caballeromontoya@idinsight.org and tobiakor@cseaafrica.org.
REOPENING SCHOOLS

When deciding on the best approach and timing to reopen schools across the country, the Nigerian government faces a tradeoff. On one hand, students returning to schools and childcare settings in greater numbers will allow more families to return to work. This might be especially relevant for communities where lower-income parents cannot afford to forgo work outside the home. However, return to school carries the public health risk of a resurgence of COVID-19 infection among students, staff, and communities. The recommendations below are meant to augment the guidelines released by the federal government to ensure schools reopen safely.

A PHASED APPROACH

An initial selective reopening of schools, followed by a gradual increase in numbers, will make it easier to keep student groups small and dispersed. Priority for reopening could include factors such as:

- **Specific educational groups**, such as vulnerable and low-income students who are less likely to be equipped to benefit from remote learning tools launched by the government, and more likely to rely on school for non-academic support, such as school meals.
- **Specific grades**, such as pre-primary and primary students who may have a lower risk of infection compared to older students, and require more childcare when out of school. Nigeria has already resumed classes for some transitional grades, where older students may be more prone to comply with social distancing measures and will be able to prepare and write high-stakes exams to move from one level of education to the next.
- **Specific types of schools**, where exposure to COVID-19 is reduced due to size, capacity, current enrollment, and the capability to comply with hygiene guidelines.
- **Low-risk geographic areas**, based on the progression of the pandemic and trends in the number of new confirmed cases and hospitalized patients.

The phased approach should also include staff. Those at higher risk from COVID-19 due to age or underlying medical conditions should be identified before school reopening and prioritized to stay home.

GUIDANCE FOR SCHOOLS

**Infrastructure**

- Section off common spaces and adapt floor markings to direct foot-traffic flows and help students and staff maintain social distance.
- Adapt portable hand-sanitizing and hand-washing stations at entrances and common areas to promote regular hygiene.
- Space out tables and chairs in dining areas and classrooms so they are 2 meters apart.
- Engage school administrators to ensure that soap and water are available in schools.
- Procure and distribute critical hygiene items (commercial detergents, chlorine, mop, buckets) and basic personal protection equipment (gloves, masks) for use by cleaning staff.
Health and sanitation

- Remind and train students, teachers, and staff on why, when, and how to comply with infection prevention and control measures such as hand washing, social distancing, and other hygiene measures.?
- Train cleaning staff on safe disinfection practices.
- Re-establish regular and safe delivery of essential services (i.e. health services such as school feeding and vaccination campaigns).
- Ensure that school meals are prepared and served under strict hygienic conditions.3
- Disseminate age and language appropriate messages on hygiene at school and at home.
- Supply students with a one-time hygiene kit to be used for hand hygiene before and after meals.
- Establish mandatory temperature checks for students and staff.
- Promote the appropriate and consistent use of face masks taking into consideration the different challenges faced by students, teachers, and staff based on age groups, pre-existing medical conditions, and disabilities.
- Mandate sick students and staff remain at home and procure a space to quarantine symptomatic students and staff throughout the day.
- Ensure efficient communication between school administrators and local health officials to notify of any case of COVID-19.

School scheduling

- Divide students into cohorts (i.e. by grade) and assign different cohorts different days to come to school to reduce the overall concentration of students.
- Stagger school openings, starting with a few days a week5 and adding days based on the reduction in the incidence of COVID-19.
- Staggering start, close, and break times of the school day to decrease the number of students and staff interacting with each other.
- Enforce strict movement within schools, including restrictions on hall movement, classroom movement, and lunchroom seating. Stagger class schedules to avoid overlap in hallways and classrooms.
- Limit interaction between teachers.

---

1 Students and teachers should wash their hands frequently, after touching surfaces; coming out of public transportation; touching door handles, elevator doors, and buttons; entering and coming out of toilets and bathrooms; before and after eating; and after coughing, sneezing, or blowing their nose. Where possible, tissue paper is recommended for blowing your nose as it can be discarded immediately after use; tissue that usually sits in toilet stalls should be avoided as it is often contaminated with fecal matter, increasing the chances of fecal-oral transmission of COVID-19. The appropriate time taken to clean hands is also important (scrub your hands for at least 20 seconds).
2 Avoid touching eyes, nose, and mouth without proper handwashing; cover your cough or sneeze with a tissue, then throw it in the trash.
3 Personnel must wear a mask and, when possible, gloves while cooking and helping students to serve food during mealtime.
4 Contactless thermometers are expensive, might be in short supply, and might have high distribution costs attached.
5 This approach would follow a flipped classroom design. Only a fraction of students will be able to enter the school each day; the rest will rely on continued distance learning on days when they are out of school.
SUPPORT FOR MAJOR STAKEHOLDERS

As schools prepare to reopen, the Nigerian government should coordinate with different stakeholders.

- Engage with parents and teachers to define and clearly communicate roles and responsibilities.
- Link public health and school authorities to design, communicate, and deploy a set of public health messages and training for school staff, students, and parents.
- Distribute a “Safe School Reopening Checklist” to facilitate reopening decisions and compliance.
- Ensure back-to-school strategies are implemented appropriately.

Teachers
- Develop pedagogical processes to assess progress and learning losses during school closure.\(^6\)
- Plan for recovery of instructional time, revise the school calendar, and adjust learning priorities to ensure teachers can cover the curriculum in a shorter academic year.\(^7\)
- Ensure teachers are able to return to work and provide training to offer psychosocial\(^8\) and academic support.
- Provide teachers with professional development options to explore curriculum adaptation through peer learning groups on mobile platforms or remote learning tools.

Parents
- Use multiple channels of communication (radio, television, internet, community meetings, and direct teacher-parent communication) to educate parents on the causes, symptoms, and dangers of COVID-19, along with the most important prevention measures.
- Encourage parents and caregivers to talk with their children about COVID-19, symptoms, and preventative measures in a way that children understand.
- Encourage parents to self-report to the school if their children have symptoms of COVID-19, tested positive, or were exposed to someone with COVID-19 within the last 14 days.
- Ensure children do not attend school if they or a member of their household have symptoms of COVID-19. Parents and caregivers should seek medical care if they notice their children or other household members are displaying symptoms similar to COVID-19.
- Encourage parents and caregivers to coordinate with schools to ensure timely information sharing, adherence to preventive guidelines, and provision of support.
- Empower parents and caregivers to keep children at home if considered clinically vulnerable.
- Encourage parents or guardians to clean and disinfect utensils, school uniforms, and food containers at the end of each day.
- Encourage children to practice good hygiene at home to reinforce good practices at school.
- Encourage parents and caregivers to be good role models by practicing proper hygiene.

---

\(^6\) Consider designing and implementing remedial courses to mitigate learning losses.

\(^7\) This can be done at a centralized level or schools can be given the autonomy to adjust the curriculum and calendar based on student learning levels, and how much in-school instruction schools are able to provide.

\(^8\) One of the largest side effects of the COVID-19 lockdown is expected to be the increased risk of violence, abuse, and exploitation, especially among girls.
- Encourage parents and caregivers to equip children with the necessary safety gear such as face masks and hand sanitizers. For schools that mandate children wear protective gear, parents and caregivers should encourage children to start wearing the gear at home to get accustomed.

**Community**

- Ensure community engagement and use of mobile platforms to establish effective communication channels with parents’ and teachers’ associations.
- Use multiple channels of communication (radio, television, internet, community meetings) to inform community members about mechanisms for reopening schools.
- Get in touch with local authorities and ensure they are distributing the most up-to-date information on school reopenings.
- Address any misinformation that may prompt doubt or fear.
- Encourage parents and caregivers to take their children to school or childcare on foot or by bike to prevent crowding in public transport.

**LESSONS FROM REOPENING IN GHANA**

- Schools in Ghana closed as of March 15, 2020 to mitigate the spread of COVID-19. Major exams such as WASSCE were suspended due to the health risks posed by the virus.
- The government put in place a number of measures including contact tracing and case monitoring.
- The Ministry of Education and the Ghana Education Service made some provisions to shift learning online, with lessons broadcasted on television and radio. Online learning platforms have also been set up with an emphasis on core subjects: Mathematics, English, Science, and Social Studies.
- As restrictions eased, the government permitted final-year university and junior and senior high school learners to resume classes and take WASSCE and BECE exams between June and September.
- Before reopening, schools were disinfected and all students and staff given face masks.
- Just four weeks after reopening, more than 100 students in 14 Senior High Schools across Ghana tested positive for COVID-19. After the registered COVID-19 outbreaks, the education authorities introduced a set of measures to determine the extent of the outbreak and set in place containment strategies. Schools remained opened and students were encouraged to remain in school to avoid a further spread of the virus in the community.
- As a continuation of the phased reopening of schools, second year junior and senior high school students are expected to return to school from October 5 to December 14.
- All nursery, kindergarten, primary and first-year junior and senior high school students will remain at home until January 2021.
- In a survey conducted by IPA, only 32 percent of households reported being contacted by schools, indicating that not all children are involved in school-driven remote learning. Further, respondents reported that 64 percent of primary and 57 percent of secondary school children were spending time on education at home since schools were closed. Children in the household indicated spending an average of 5.9 hours per week on education.
LESSONS FROM REOPENING IN SOUTH AFRICA

- Schools in South Africa closed on March 18, 2020, as their caseload was the highest on the continent.
- Grade 7 and 12 students returned to school on June 1, with an additional 6 million students going back to school in early July. Cases peaked in late July and schools closed again on July 27 for the majority of students.
- Schools reopened again during August at a slower pace and under a phased approach targeting different grades. The government also modified the academic calendar, extending the 2020 school year into 2021.
- Measures include the provision of two cloth masks for every child, disinfection of schools, social distancing measures, and appointing a full-time screener to clear school staff and students.
- Some teachers and parents have voiced concern over the reopening, citing that some schools are already overcrowded and lack running water.
- Schools will not be allowed to reopen unless they comply with government regulations.

REOPENING SCHOOLS TO RECOVER LEARNING LOSS

LEARNING LEVELS PRE-PANDEMIC

There are approximately 13.5 million children of primary school age who are currently not enrolled in school in Nigeria. This is an alarming number in its own right, and even more so when considering the overwhelming evidence that learning levels for the students currently enrolled in schools are much lower than expected.

According to a 2015 National Education Data Survey (NEDS), which covered 84,324 students from pre-primary to junior secondary school, over half (51 percent) could not identify words, read a single short, or demonstrate basic comprehension in English or any of Nigeria’s three main native languages. Of the sample, about 45 percent were unable to add two single-digit numbers which sum to less than 10. Using the same dataset and focusing on a subsample of students in Primary 1 and 2, another estimate conducted by the Centre for the Study of the Economies of Africa (CSEA), which factors in analysis of the Nigerian school curriculum content, found that only about 17 percent of students met the literacy competency for their level, while 31 percent met the numeracy competency. Another household assessment of learning conducted by The Education Partnership (TEP) Centre in Nigeria found that only 59 percent of 15-year-olds were able to read a Primary 2 level story, and 41 percent could complete a one-digit multiplication task.
In addition, there are huge variations along key demographic characteristics, including wealth quintile, rural-urban dwelling, and public vs. private school attendance. According to the NEDS study:

- Approximately 14 percent of the lowest wealth quintile showed minimum learning competencies in literacy and numeracy, compared to 82 percent and 84 percent of the highest quintile in literacy and numeracy respectively.
- Students in private primary schools achieved 74 percent and 84 percent literacy and numeracy competencies, while students in public schools achieved 44 percent and 56 percent, respectively.

Using their own estimate of the NEDS data, the study conducted by CSEA found:

- A 17 percent margin in rural-urban performance for literacy, and a 25 percent margin for numeracy.
- Literacy achievement was highest in the South-South region (27 percent) and lowest in the North West (8 percent), while numeracy performance was highest in the South West (54 percent), and lowest in the North West (9 percent).

**AN ESTIMATE OF LEARNING LOSS DUE TO COVID-19**

It is hard to decipher the actual learning loss arising from the pandemic-induced school closures in Nigeria, as schools are yet to fully reopen. However, Nigeria’s National Bureau of Statistics (NBS) conducted three rounds of phone surveys (in April, June, and July 2020) on different mediums that the government, schools, and parents are using to sustain learning amidst the crisis, and results already indicate that learning losses are huge and far-reaching. Furthermore, the percent of students (who were in school prior to the pandemic) that engaged in any form of educational activity post school closures fell from 64 percent in April to 57 percent in July, a statistically significant difference. This indicates some fatigue in learning continuity due to prolonged school closures. Looking at the different mediums of sustaining learning, less than 1 percent of the students used online learning. The majority of learning takes place through self-learning or parental support. Mediums like radio, TV, and education Apps are also moderately used and
there is uptake in usage between April and July, but the proportion of students using the tools at any point in time is below 30 percent. These findings point in one direction: students have been largely disconnected from the formal school system since school closures, an indication that learning has not been taking place, and the loss sustained will be significant.

*Figure 2: Education Activities in Nigeria during COVID-19. Source: NBS, 2020.*

Learning losses are likely to amplify existing educational inequalities, with rural and Northern regions likely to fall even further behind compared to urban and Southern regions.

**REVAMPING, NOT RECOVERY: PRIORITIZING LEARNING**

To address the poor learning levels pre-pandemic, and the learning losses induced by the pandemic, it is imperative to incorporate innovative measures to support and accelerate learning when schools reopen. We draw on the available evidence to highlight five crucial approaches.

1. **Focus on foundational learning.** This relates to the minimum level of competency required for effective functioning of an individual for higher learning or transition to work. Foundational learning focuses on reading and comprehension (in the language of the learner’s immediate environment) and arithmetic. Typical school schedules and curriculum in Nigeria consist of foundational learning plus other school subjects. However, given the time and learning lost to COVID-19, at least the next two school calendars should place greater focus on foundational learning. First, school time during the phased reopening is shorter both in length (number of months) and breadth (hours spent per day), which requires prioritizing what to teach. Second, weakness in foundational learning is at the crux of Nigeria’s poor performance in education, as it serves as the gateway to knowledge acquisition in other subject areas. Third, the education workforce is undergoing health, psychological, and financial effects
of the pandemic, which may create labour shortages in the initial phase of school reopening. Concentrating on foundational learning helps to reduce the burden on the education workforce, and in the interim, teachers of non-foundational subject areas can serve as support staff for language (English or local language) and arithmetic teachers.

Focusing on foundational learning will help the Nigerian education system recover not only learning lost to COVID-19, but also past losses due to systemic and structural challenges affecting learning.

2. **Implement frequent, decision-relevant learning assessments at the school level.** As schools reopen, there is a need to know how far behind students are, and how fast they are recovering. Assessments at the school level, rather than large-scale surveys, will equip school leaders and teachers with locally-relevant information.\(^9\) The goal of the assessments should be to provide feedback to inform swift, targeted responses. High-stakes examinations at the end of the school term should be postponed until recovery from learning loss to prevent unjust penalties for vulnerable groups that have been disproportionately affected by COVID-19.

3. **Leverage school reopening to introduce Teaching at the Right Level.** School systems in Nigeria are mostly organized by grades, with teaching targeted at grade or age levels. The Teaching at the Right Level (TaRL) approach centers school organization and teaching on the skill-level of different learners. Several studies have documented substantial learning gains from this approach (Kaffenberger & Pritchett, 2020, Banerjee et al. 2016). School reopening represents a strategic opportunity to widely adopt this proven approach in order to best help students recover learning loss.

4. **Pilot and test tailored blended learning approaches.** Advances in technology have sparked a paradigm shift in education by breaking down geographical barriers to learning. School closures induced by the pandemic have resulted in a surge in the development and uptake of educational technology around the world. However, geographic barriers have given way to new barriers -- digital divides -- with most schools in Nigeria unable to leverage technology for learning during the pandemic, meaning that students at schools with fewer resources are likely to fall behind.

Given Nigeria’s socio-economic disparities and poor infrastructure, educational technology will not work in isolation. School reopening presents an opportunity to work with research and development partners to pilot and rigorously test the effectiveness of blended learning approaches (a combination of in-person and remote learning) tailored to different regional contexts in Nigeria and aligned with different profiles of deprived learners and under-resourced learning environments. Innovative approaches that are cognizant of infrastructure and knowledge disparities will be crucial during and after the pandemic to ensure a variety of learners can take advantage of in-person and remote opportunities suited to their needs.

---

\(^9\) While standardized, nationally or regionally representative assessments could inform large-scale policy responses, they may not be feasible in a timely manner or with enough frequency to track changes and inform interventions as students return to school.
5. **Prioritize the needs of vulnerable students.** Given inequalities in learning levels for students that experience various dimensions of poverty and exclusion, it is important to prioritize reopening schools and areas with an overrepresentation of vulnerable populations, including students from low socio-economic backgrounds, rural areas, the Northern region, and students in public schools. These students will likely need the most investment to recover from learning losses in the previous academic year, as well as additional non-academic support, including material and psycho-social, to ensure they are equipped to learn. Prioritizing the needs of vulnerable students is critical for Nigeria’s education system to make an inclusive and equitable recovery and build the foundation for future progress.

**RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE FEDERAL GOVERNMENT**

The bulk of the responsibility for the school reopening recommendations outlined above lies with state governments and private school leaders. However, the federal government can support this effort in a number of areas:

1. **Augmenting state and private sector resources** that are already depleted due to the COVID-19 shock, and allowing state governments more flexibility in spending their subvention from the Universal Basic Education Commission (UBEC).

2. **Being flexible with curriculum standards**, so that content fits with local needs and realities.

3. **Sharing knowledge and learning** on successes and failures in the Nigerian context, to be better prepared in the event of a second wave.

4. **Setting in motion key directions for the long-term restructuring of Nigeria’s education system.** The pandemic has made clear that technology is crucial to the education system going forward. It is imperative to integrate digital education and technology into the school system and expand curriculum from the conventional 3Rs (writing, reading, and arithmetic) to a curriculum that is cognizant of the realities of the modern world.
REFERENCES


27. “State by state: When (and how) will Germany’s schools open again?”, The Local, April 22, 2020. https://www.thelocal.de/20200422/state-by-state-when-will-germany-s-schools-open-again


